



Bu Proje Avrupa Birliđi tarafından finanse edilmektedir.  
This project is funded by the European Union.



**YEREL YÖNETİM REFORMU  
PROJESİ (YYR III)**  
LOCAL ADMINISTRATION REFORM  
PROJECT (LAR III)

## Inter-municipal Experience Sharing Needs Assessment Report

01.12.2020

Muhittin Acar, Emre Koyuncu, Can Okman

<b>Component</b>	Component 2- Capacity Building for New Metropolitan Municipality Model and Inclusive Local Governance Processes
<b>Activity</b>	2.1.3. Modelling development for implementing new metropolitan municipality model in different contexts and improvement of coordination and co-operation among metropolitan municipalities in this context
<b>Output</b>	Needs Assessment Report

Local Administration Reform Phase III (LAR-III) is funded by the European Union under the Pre-Accession Financial Assistance. The beneficiaries of the Project are the Republic of Turkey Ministry of Interior and Ministry of Environment and Urbanization. The Central Finance and Contracts Unit is the contracting authority of the Project. Technical assistance for the implementation of the Project is provided by the United Nations Development Programme. The content of this report does not reflect the official opinion of the European Union and UNDP. Responsibility for the information and views expressed in the report lies entirely with the authors.



Empowered lives.  
Resilient nations.

**Table of Contents**

**Introduction ..... 3**

**1. Research methodology and general characteristics of respondents ..... 4**

**2. Interest in experience sharing and highlighted fields ..... 7**

**3. Prioritization of themes..... 9**

**4. Determination of experience to share on activities ..... 12**

**5. Method of Activity and Participation ..... 13**

**6. Work Plan..... 15**

**ANNEX 1: Questionnaire..... 17**

**ANNEX 2: Demand and Supply Tables of Metropolitan Municipalities and Metropolitan District Municipalities by Themes ..... 24**

**ANNEX 3: Demand and Supply Tables for Prioritised Experience Sharing Activities of Metropolitan Municipalities by Function and Municipality ..... 26**

**ANNEX 4: Criteria on good practice sharing ..... 47**

## Introduction

This report is prepared under Activity 2.1.3 of the Local Administration Reform Project Phase III (LAR-III). The goal of this report is to determine the topics and methods of inter-municipal experience sharing activities.

The Project Document defines Activity 2.1.3 as “Modelling development for implementing new metropolitan municipality model in different contexts and improvement of coordination and co-operation among metropolitan municipalities in this context.”

Accordingly, the sub-activities and flow are as follows:

- Based on the findings of the Impact Assessment Report created under 2.1.1, assessment of the needs and strengths for implementation of the reforms as a result of new metropolitan model; in order to do this, administering an online questionnaire to 30 personnel each from 30 metropolitan municipalities covering all relevant departments,
- Preparing a needs assessment report including the areas of support which municipalities need, recommendations for this and the selection criteria and procedures to create 5 town twinning (10 municipalities in total),
- Based on the Needs Assessment Report, holding three, 2-day workshops in order to discuss the areas which are contemplated to share knowledge and experience,
- Holding three 1-day experience sharing meetings for each town twinning in the relevant municipality (15 meetings in total),
- Reporting the conclusions of experience sharing meetings, including in such report: 1) implementing the new metropolitan municipality model throughout metropolitan municipalities with the experience gained through twinning action; 2) including recommendations on maintaining mutual learning.

The working assumption of the Project Team is not to create new metropolitan municipality models beyond Law No. 6360 in respect of the so-called modelling concept, but to ascertain the practical approaches developed in the field as outlined in the present metropolitan municipality model in a manner focusing on mutual learning. Accordingly, references to “model” in the activity are addressed in this report as areas/themes where knowledge and experience are needed in the implementation of the metropolitan municipality model. The report recommends a twinning strategy which includes recommendations on activity methods and work plan alongside the topics on experience sharing and the content of the activities.

## 1. Research methodology and general characteristics of respondents

In line with the findings obtained under 2.1.1 Impact Assessment Report, the topics of experience sharing were covered in the meeting held on 7 August 2020 with the authorities of the Ministry of Environment and Urbanisation and afterwards a draft questionnaire was created. The questionnaire that was administered accordingly was shaped so as to elicit the preferences of municipalities on conveying their experience in the following main headings or benefiting from the experience of other municipalities:

- Coordination of metropolitan municipality and district municipality (service sharing, transfers, cooperation).
- Growing scale and service organisation. Actions to ensure that resources are effectively used. Capacity building actions.
- Integrated rural area management (agriculture and livestock, rural services, rural land development).
- Participation, communication with stakeholders, public relations.
- Strategic management.
- E-municipality, smart city and digital transformation.
- Human resources management.
- Social services and aids.
- Cooperation and partnerships.

It was decided that the questionnaire would be filled in by heads of department in the case of metropolitan municipalities, and by all branch chiefs in the case of metropolitan district municipalities with population over 50,000. There are 30 metropolitan municipalities and 251 metropolitan district municipalities in the survey population. When the number of departments in the Regulation on Standard Job Positions is taken as a basis, 6,641 departments, of which 1,074 are in the case of metropolitan municipalities and 5,567 are in the selected metropolitan district municipalities, constitute the study population.

The questionnaire was administered online between 31 August and 18 September following the relevant correspondence of the Ministry of Environment and Urbanization. A total of 2,150 responses were received from 30 metropolitan municipalities and 210 metropolitan district municipalities of 30 metropolitan provinces. The number of respondents at provincial level is given in the table below. The response rate constitutes 32% of study population.

Table 1. Responses to Questionnaire

PROVINCE	Number of municipalities requested to respond		Number of responding municipalities (minimum 1 response)		Number of Responses		Total Responses
	Metropolitan Municipality	District Municipality	Metropolitan Municipality	District Municipality	Metropolitan Municipality	District Municipality	
Adana	1	6	1	5	17	38	55
Ankara	1	12	1	9	24	66	90
Antalya	1	12	1	10	31	75	106
Aydın	1	6	1	2	4	7	11
Balıkesir	1	7	1	6	2	45	47
Bursa	1	12	1	12	14	127	141
Denizli	1	4	1	4	23	15	38
Diyarbakır	1	9	1	5	8	17	25
Erzurum	1	3	1	2	1	22	23
Eskişehir	1	2	1	2	16	37	53
Gaziantep	1	4	1	4	8	17	25
Hatay	1	10	1	9	1	52	53
Mersin	1	37	1	34	71	351	422
İstanbul	1	19	1	16	25	169	194
İzmir	1	7	1	7	17	24	41
Kayseri	1	4	1	2	10	10	20
Kocaeli	1	12	1	10	35	88	123
Konya	1	11	1	8	3	78	81
Malatya	1	2	1	2	17	21	38
Manisa	1	8	1	4	7	20	27
Kahramanmaraş	1	5	1	5	7	22	29
Mardin	1	9	1	10	66	97	163
Muğla	1	7	1	5	17	40	57
Ordu	1	3	1	3	2	6	8
Sakarya	1	6	1	6	2	42	44
Samsun	1	8	1	8	13	40	53
Tekirdağ	1	11	1	7	19	24	43
Trabzon	1	6	1	5	14	44	58
Şanlıurfa	1	2	1	2	15	11	26
Van	1	7	1	6	28	28	56
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>251</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>210</b>	<b>517</b>	<b>1,633</b>	<b>2,150</b>

Since the duties assumed by departments in the organisational structure of the municipalities are quite diverse, a categorization was made in the survey on the basis of general functions. The numerical distribution of respondents of the survey is shown in general terms in the table below on the basis of their functions in the municipalities. Accordingly, the highest three responses come from department employees who work in the fields of waste management (36), transportation (34),

spatial development- land development planning and control (33) and financial management (33) in the case of metropolitan municipalities; and spatial development-land development planning and control (213), waste management (188), municipal police, social order and security (148) in the case of district municipalities.

Categories of legal affairs, asset management and secretarial affairs which are listed in the last lines of the list are created separately as a result of analysing “other” responses to the questionnaire.

Table 2. Duty and responsibility fields of survey respondents by municipal functions

İşlevler	Büyükşehir Belediyesi	İlçe Belediyesi	Genel Toplam
Atık yönetimi	36	152	188
Basın, yayın, tanıtım	16	101	117
Bilgi teknolojileri ve akıllı şehirler	28	89	117
Çevre ve yeşil alan	25	90	115
Fen işleri	32	108	140
Halkla ilişkiler, muhtarlarla ilişkiler, Kent Konseyi ile ilişkiler	21	66	87
İç denetim ve teftiş	11	42	53
İnsan kaynakları yönetimi	18	89	107
İtfaiye, afet ve acil durum	23	6	29
Kırsal hizmetler, kırsal kalkınma	18	17	35
Kültür ve sanat, turizm	21	69	90
Mali yönetim	33	81	114
Mekânsal gelişim ve imar	33	180	213
Sağlık, halk sağlığı, veterinerlik	17	57	74
Sosyal hizmetler, yardımlar ve yaşam boyu öğrenme	18	61	79
Spor hizmetleri	8	28	36
Strateji geliştirme	11	28	39
Su ve kanalizasyon	29	0	29
Ulaşım	34	20	54
Zabıta, toplum düzeni ve güvenlik	18	130	148
Varlık yönetimi (Destek hiz., araç, taşınmaz yönetimi, satınalma, işletme-İştirakler)	30	86	116
Hukuk işleri	10	48	58
Sekreteryal işler (Yazı işleri, meclis-encümen, evrak kayıt, özel kalem)	10	50	60
Diğer	17	35	52
<b>TOPLAM</b>	<b>517</b>	<b>1633</b>	<b>2150</b>

Note: The size for each function is visualized with bar charts in each column.

## 2. Interest in experience sharing and highlighted fields

While 87% of respondents stated that their department would like to benefit from other departments at least in one theme out of 35 themes which were investigated in the questionnaire, 32% of respondents stated that their department engaged in some work innovatively which other municipalities should benefit from minimum one topic and they might share such work.

In this respect, it is possible through the survey for departments of municipalities to ascertain generally about “capacity and needs” for benefiting from other municipalities’ experience and conveying their experience to others.

In addition to this, supply-demand analyses in the report consider “those interested” in experience sharing activities. Contact information to communicate about the experience sharing activities under the project was requested from survey respondents, firstly the respondents were asked whether they were interested in activities or not.

The capacity of experience sharing and the need for benefiting from the experience which were indicated in the name of department, decreased when participation in the activities was concerned. Even though it was not asked in the questionnaire, the reasons such as current workload were estimated to cause that decrease. Accordingly, for example, while 84% of the survey respondents from metropolitan municipalities indicated that they would like to benefit from the experience of other municipalities, those who stated that they would like to participate in experience sharing activities decreased to 54%.

Table 3. Distribution of needs, capacity and interest in experience sharing

	Metropolitan Municipality	District Municipality	Overall
<b>Those who stated that they would like to benefit from the experience of other municipalities (need)</b>	<b>84%</b>	<b>88%</b>	<b>87%</b>
<i>Those interested in the experience sharing activity</i>	<i>54%</i>	<i>63%</i>	<i>61%</i>
<i>Those not interested in the experience sharing activity</i>	<i>30%</i>	<i>26%</i>	<i>27%</i>
<b>Those who stated that they had innovative practices and might share with other municipalities</b>	<b>49%</b>	<b>26%</b>	<b>32%</b>
<i>Those interested in the experience sharing activity</i>	<i>36%</i>	<i>19%</i>	<i>23%</i>
<i>Those not interested in the experience sharing activity</i>	<i>13%</i>	<i>8%</i>	<i>9%</i>

In order to prioritize among the themes in the questionnaire, supply for the experience sharing (those who are interested in the activities to share their experience) and demand for the experience sharing (those who are interested in the activities to benefit from others’ experience) are analysed. Absolute supply and demand numbers of metropolitan municipalities and metropolitan district municipalities according to themes are listed in the table below.

Table 4. Supply and demand relations for the experience sharing

Tema	Büyükşehir Belediyeleri		BŞ İlçe Belediyeleri	
	Talep	Arz	Talep	Arz
1.0 Büyükşehir-ilçe belediye koordinasyonu				
1.1 Devredilebilir hizmetlerin etkili koordinasyonu için mekanizmalar	71	25	286	15
1.2 Paylaşılan hizmetlerde etkili koordinasyon için mekanizmalar	77	22	387	41
1.3 Diğer alanlarda etkili işbirliği ve koordinasyon için mekanizmalar, örnekler	78	25	406	26
2.0 Büyüyen ölçek ve hizmet örgütlenmesi				
2.1 Teşkilat yapısının yenilenmesi, hizmetlerin il ve ilçe düzeyinde örgütlenmesi, koordinasyonu	114	30	502	26
2.2 İl düzeyinde planlama ve hizmet sunumuna yönelik veritabanı, arayüz vb. oluşturulması	122	26	520	22
2.3 Araç, makine ve malzemelerin daha verimli kullanılmasına ve takibine yönelik çalışmalar	108	23	467	26
3.0 Entegre kırsal alan yönetimi				
3.1 Altyapı, sosyal ve ekonomik gelişime yönelik hizmetlerin bütüncül olarak planlanması ve yönetimi	78	17	360	22
3.2 Kırsalda imar mevzuatının uygulanması, imar planlarının hazırlanması ve denetimi	67	14	315	13
3.3 Kırsala, tarım ve hayvancılığa, kooperatiflere yönelik desteklerin planlanması ve uygulanması	68	16	320	18
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler				
4.1 Kent konseyi belediye ilişkileri	95	21	463	30
4.2 Kent konseyinin belediye hizmetlerinin planlanmasında ve izlenmesinde rolü	97	21	472	27
4.3 Kent kararlarına mahalle meclisleri ve muhtarların katılımı	93	21	452	35
4.4 Talep ve şikayet yönetimine yönelik beyaz masa, muhtarlarla ilişkiler vb.	83	27	470	55
4.5 Yatırım yapılacak yerlerde yatırımdan etkilenecek gruplarla ilişkiler	100	17	477	34
5.0 Stratejik yönetim				
5.1 Stratejik planlama, hedef, gösterge belirleme	114	30	542	49
5.2 Bütçe yönetimi	103	28	503	47
5.3 Kalite/Performans yönetim sistemleri	118	26	535	39
5.4 İç kontrol süreçleri	110	29	506	33
5.5 İç denetim süreçleri	103	24	496	31
5.6 Projelendirme	109	31	544	28
6.0 Elektronik belediyeçilik, akıllı kent ve dijital dönüşüm				
6.1 E-belediye, dijital belediye vb. sistemlerin kurulumu ve kullanımı	110	36	551	48
6.2 Akıllı kent çalışmaları, bilişim sistemlerinin hizmetlerde kullanılması	110	36	568	24
6.3 Yönetim bilgi sistemlerinin ve teknolojilerinin kullanımı	113	29	544	22
6.4 Veri politikaları ve yönetiminde yenilikçi çalışmalar	112	26	551	16
7.0 İnsan kaynakları yönetimi				
7.1 İnsan kaynakları politikalarının oluşturulması, insan gücü ve istihdam planlaması	96	14	435	14
7.2 Personel mevzuatı ve işlemlerinin yürütülmesinde yenilikçi yaklaşımlar	97	17	492	20
7.3 Kurumsal öğrenme, hizmet içi eğitim, personelin yetiştirilmesi uygulamaları	106	24	544	15
7.4 Personelin performansını izlemeye ve geliştirmeye yönelik yaklaşımlar	124	14	566	17
8.0 Sosyal hizmetler ve yardımlar				
8.1 Dezavantajlı kesimlerin belirlenmesine, takibine yönelik kurallar ve uygulamalar	69	26	351	44
8.2 Sosyal hizmet ve yardımların sunumunun iyileştirilmesine dönük çalışmalar	73	22	338	44
8.3 Sosyal hizmet ve yardım süreçlerinde paydaşlarla işbirliği ve koordinasyon	77	21	354	48
9.0 İşbirliği ve ortaklıklar				
9.1 Kamu-özel sektör işbirliği, yap-işlet-devret vb. modeller	112	15	473	20
9.2 Finansör kuruluşlarla ilişkiler	121	16	473	12
9.3 Belediyeler arası yurt içi ve yurt dışı işbirliği, kardeş şehir ilişkileri	111	23	530	25
9.4 Sivil toplum kuruluşlarıyla, vakıflar ve derneklerle ilişkiler, işbirliği ve ortak projeler	113	26	533	30

Note 1: Bar charts show the size of the theme within each related column.

Note 2: Theme headings are abbreviated. For the original questions in the questionnaire, see also Annex 1 Questionnaire.

Note 3: Themes in the table are sorted by the order in the questionnaire. For the table in which themes are listed according to their demand size, see also Annex 2.

### 3. Prioritization of themes

In the Project Terms of Reference, fifteen 1-day experience sharing (twinning) activities among metropolitan municipalities are required. In the context of implementation approach, district municipalities were included in the analysis, the questionnaire was transmitted to all district municipalities with population over 50,000 in addition to metropolitan municipalities. However, considering that this study focused on metropolitan municipalities, it was contemplated that 10 experience sharing activities out of 15 would be held among metropolitan municipalities and 5 among district municipalities. In addition to the 15 experience sharing activities in question, four 1-day experience sharing activities would be utilised within the context of workshop days laid down in the Terms of Reference. In the context of requests of beneficiary ministries and requests which might emerge during the implementation of the activity, it was deemed appropriate that the content of those four activities would be determined afterwards in line with the themes discussed in the questionnaire.

As shown in the Table 4, even though the themes allowed many activities in both metropolitan municipalities and metropolitan district municipalities, the determination of the fifteen activities in the context of the project was prioritised. 35 themes which were investigated in 9 main headings in the questionnaire were prioritised according to absolute demand sizes. In this context, the themes which were above the median were taken as a basis.

On the other hand, since the themes under the main heading constitute an integral topic, it is contemplated that activities are held in the context of main themes; however, shared experience are determined in the context of sub-themes.

Accordingly, it is planned that the experience are shared in the context of 5 headings which are listed according to the demand size below, and the themes under those headings, 10 activities in total, being 2 activities in each heading, are to be held in the activities of experience sharing among metropolitan municipalities.

The organisation of two activities per heading means that the scope remains the same whereas the experience to be shared (i.e. presenters) is different in two groups. Only the main theme Cooperation and Partnerships is contemplated to be organised as separate contents in form of 1) Public-Private Partnership + Relations with financing institutions 2) Relations with NGOs + inter-municipal relations. On the other hand, the heading “project design” under the strategic management may be evaluated under public-private partnership and relations with financing institutions.

In prioritised topics, while the respondents from minimum 24, maximum 28 metropolitan municipalities are on the demand side, the respondents from minimum 9, maximum 17 metropolitan municipalities are on the supply side.

The supply and demand information of prioritised themes for the activities among metropolitan municipalities and contemplated numbers of activities are given in the table below, metropolitan municipalities reporting supply and demand for each theme are presented in the annex by department. ([Annex 3](#)).

Table 5. Themes determined for experience sharing activities among metropolitan municipalities

Theme	Demand (person)	Supply (person)	Number of Mun. (Demand)	Number of Mun. (Supply)	Number of activities (day)
<b>2.0 Growing scale and service organisation</b>					<b>2</b>
2.1 Renewal of organisational architecture, service organisation and coordination at provincial and district level	114	30	27	16	
2.2 Creating database, interface, etc. regarding planning and service delivery at provincial level	122	26	26	12	
2.3 Studies on supervision and more effective utilisation of vehicles, machinery and materials	108	23	26	13	
<b>5.0 Strategic management</b>					<b>2</b>
5.1 Strategic planning, setting goals and indicators	114	30	24	16	
5.3 Quality/Performance management systems	118	26	25	13	
5.4 Internal control processes	110	29	25	16	
5.6 Project design	109	31	26	14	
<b>6.0 E-municipality, smart city and digital transformation</b>					<b>2</b>
6.1 Installation and utilisation of e-municipality, digital municipality etc. systems	110	36	24	17	
6.2 Smart city actions, utilisation of information technology systems in services	110	36	25	17	
6.3 Utilisation of management information systems and technologies	113	29	26	14	
6.4 Innovative studies on data policies and data management	112	26	27	12	
<b>7.0 Human resources management</b>					<b>2</b>
7.3 Institutional learning, in-service training , staff training practices	106	24	26	12	
7.4 Approaches to monitoring and improving staff performance	124	14	26	9	
<b>9.0 Cooperation and partnerships</b>					<b>2</b>
9.1 Public-private partnership, build-operate-transfer models etc.	112	15	25	10	
9.2 Relations with financing institutions	121	16	28	12	
9.3 Inter-municipal, national and foreign cooperation, town twinning relations	111	23	26	15	
9.4 Relations, cooperation and joint projects with non-governmental organisations, foundations and associations	113	26	28	13	

Note: Theme headings are abbreviated. For the original questions in the questionnaire, see also [Annex 1](#) Survey.

Not 2: Themes in the table are sorted by the order in the questionnaire. For the table in which themes are listed according to their demand size, see also: [Annex 2](#)

In the case of metropolitan district municipalities, the contemplated five activities in the context of themes which are sorted according to demand ranking in each main heading below, is planned to be 1 event for each title.

The main topics which are prioritised in 9 main headings are the same in metropolitan and metropolitan district municipalities; however, the demand sizes have various differences. For example, considering the most demanded sub-themes in the case of metropolitan municipalities, “2.Growing scale and service organisation” is the first in the ranking, while in the case of metropolitan district municipalities the most demanded theme is “6. E-municipality, smart city and digital transformation”. While metropolitan municipalities prioritise 4 of 6 themes under the strategic management heading by excluding (relatively demanding less) themes “5.2 Budget management” and “5.5 Internal audit”, the demands of metropolitan district municipalities are high in all strategic management themes. Accordingly, in the “7. Human resources management” area, the metropolitan district municipalities prioritise 3 of 4 themes while the metropolitan municipalities prioritise 2 of 4 themes in the questionnaire. The theme titled “7.1 Developing human resources policies, manpower and employment planning” are not prioritized because of the low demand in both municipality groups.

The following table gives supply and demand information and contemplated numbers of the activities of the prioritised themes for the activities among metropolitan district municipalities; the metropolitan district municipalities which reported their demand and supply requests for each theme were not included in this report because the tables in the department detail would be very long. The tables in question will be used to organise activities.

Table 6. The contemplated themes for the experience sharing activities among the metropolitan district municipalities

Theme	Demand (person)	Supply (person)	Number of Mun. (Demand)	Number of Mun. (Supply)	Number of activities (day)
<b>2.0 Growing scale and service organisation</b>					1
2.1 Renewal of organisational architecture, service organisation and coordination at provincial and district level	502	26	171	20	
2.2 Creating database, interface, etc. regarding planning and service delivery at provincial level	520	22	175	22	
<b>5.0 Strategic management</b>					1
5.1 Strategic planning, setting goals and indicators	542	49	169	35	
5.2 Budget management	503	47	166	33	

5.3 Quality/Performance management systems	535	39	172	27	
5.4 Internal control processes	506	33	166	26	
5.5 Internal audit processes	496	31	164	25	
5.6 Project design	544	28	173	24	
<b>6.0 E-municipality, smart city and digital transformation</b>					
6.1 Installation and utilisation of e-municipality, digital municipality etc. systems	551	48	177	39	1
6.2 Smart city actions, utilisation of information technology systems in services	568	24	181	22	
6.3 Utilisation of management information systems and technologies	544	22	176	21	
6.4 Innovative studies on data policies and data management	551	16	177	15	
<b>7.0 Human resources management</b>					
7.2 Innovative approaches on personnel legislation and conducting personnel actions	492	20	169	17	1
7.3 Institutional learning, in-service training , staff training practices	544	15	170	12	
7.4 Approaches to monitoring and improving staff performance	566	17	174	15	
<b>9.0 Cooperation and partnerships</b>					
9.3 Inter-municipal, national and foreign cooperation, town twinning relations	530	25	172	19	1
9.4 Relations, cooperation and joint projects with non-governmental organisations, foundations and associations	533	30	168	22	

Note: Theme headings are abbreviated. For the original questions in the questionnaire, see also: [Annex 1](#) Questionnaire.

Not 2: Themes in the table are sorted by the order in the questionnaire. For the table in which themes are listed according to their demand size, see also [Annex 2](#)

#### 4. Determination of experience to share on activities

The determination of the basic points on the experience to be shared by contacting with the respondents who stated that they could share their experience, is quite significant in order to perform the activities in accordance with their goal. Hence, the criteria were analysed of some good practices by various international institutions ([Annex 4](#)). Hence, the municipalities will be asked to request survey respondents to fill in maximum 1-page experience form which includes the questions below in order to summarize the experience of the survey respondents who stated that they could convey their experience, and afterwards the form will be evaluated:

- Heading (subject) of the experience which you would like to convey
- Clarification of the experience (In a way to answer briefly “What, How, Why, Where, When, Who” questions)
- Which problems were solved in the experience?
- What are the innovative approaches of the experience?
- How were the process and participation profiles if the experience emerged in a participatory process?

- What kind of constraints/problems did you face about the experience? How were those constraints / problems addressed?
- To what extent and how the sustainability of the experience was provided or how will be provided?
- Can the experience be extended to (replicated in) other municipalities?
- Have you ever shared such knowledge/experience before?

This framework will be also used as a recommended template when preparing the presentations. However, instead of implementing the template strictly, general and flexible implementation of the template is required in order to convey unique sides of the experience and not to have a great difficulty in preparing the presentations. The presenters will be asked to pay attention to those headings as much as possible while preparing and presenting the presentations.

1-page experience sharing forms which are outlined above, will be directly delivered to municipality officials (presenter candidates) who gave their contact information by stating that they could convey the experience. After 1 week period, the Local Administrations Advisory Group will be consulted to select the incoming forms to determine the agenda of events, and prioritize the forms if they come in numbers that will exceed event capacities. By evaluating the forms according to compatibility with the theme, innovativeness, extension and impact criteria, the Project Team will make their proposal to the Local Administrations Advisory Group. Confirmation of this process is contemplated by holding a workshop for two days for the experience sharing activities among metropolitan municipalities at first and then the experience sharing activities among metropolitan district municipalities.

After the prioritisation of the experience, by contacting the designated presenters, the participation on the date of the activity of designated presenters will be confirmed and they will be asked to prepare their presentations.

## **5. Method of Activity and Participation**

The experience sharing activities will be performed first among metropolitan municipalities. As explained above, holding 10 activities in 5 main headings is contemplated. 5 activities among metropolitan district municipalities will be performed after the activities of metropolitan municipalities are completed.

It is contemplated that the activities will be held through video conference, enabling persons to participate in the activities at their own places. Accordingly, Zoom program infrastructure of UNDP is planned to be utilised.

The agenda which includes the names of the presenters and the information related to the presentation will be sent to the municipality officials who notify their demand for benefiting from the activities in the survey and convey their contact information and they will be asked to register to the registration system provided on the Zoom program. 100 participants which Zoom Professional program allows for each activity will be accepted on the basis of the order of applications.

According to the Project Terms of Reference, the experience sharing activities are 1-day activities. In this framework, each activity is planned to be maximum 1 day.

Classification and sorting will be made according to the topics of the presentations to be determined. Accordingly, maximum 10 presentations, 15 minutes each on average are contemplated on the day. The activities will be moderated by the Project Team. In this framework, communication of written and verbal questions and inclusion of spectators from various municipalities to the process by moderators will be encouraged in order that presenters and participants interact with each other.

In case of low participation, participation of metropolitan district municipalities in the events of metropolitan municipalities may be discussed in the frame of technical capacity. Utilisation of such methods will be evaluated by the Project Team in case of low participation after holding the first activity.

The presentations will be recorded by getting permission from those concerned in order that a wider audience may benefit from them. It is recommended that the presentation records are posted on the project website or any website which may be suitable.

Lessons learned from the experience sharing activities, matters that the municipalities participating in the activities dwell on frequently, will be reported on thematic basis. The points regarding to reporting will be clearer after starting to implement framework activities.

The twinning strategy which is improved under this report, will bring a wider interpretation to the framework which is described in the Terms of Reference from the following aspects:

- 1) The Terms of Reference provides that workshops and experience sharing meetings are held face to face (i.e. physically). However, it is thought that these workshops and meetings are held on the web because of pandemic.
- 2) In the Terms of Reference, it is contemplated that twinning activities are performed among 10 metropolitan municipalities in groups of two. As a result of the questionnaire for the purpose of Needs Assessment, it is seen that all metropolitan municipalities are interested in sharing their experience and benefiting from the experience of other municipalities. Therefore, method of the activities is described as the meetings which municipality officials, who would like to share their experience and benefit from others' experience, gather together rather than municipalities gathering in groups of two. The inability to hold the meetings physically and necessity to hold the activities on the web will allow gathering of many participants.
- 3) In the Terms of Reference, it is contemplated that twinning activities are made among metropolitan municipalities. However, metropolitan system constitutes a whole with metropolitan district municipalities. By negotiating with the Ministry of Environment and Urbanisation, needs assessment questionnaire was also sent to metropolitan district municipalities with population over 50,000 along with metropolitan municipalities. In this context, it is contemplated that experience sharing activities for the metropolitan district municipalities, which are interested in sharing experience and benefiting from others' experience, are held additionally in the context of the results from the questionnaire.
- 4) In the Terms of Reference, it is contemplated that based on the Needs Assessment Report, three 2-day workshops are held in order to discuss the areas of knowledge and experience sharing. In the context of this report, a process is recommended which is not described in the Terms of Reference but necessary for determining the experience to be shared in the activities. Accordingly, it is recommended that the municipalities which stated their interest in response to the questionnaire to share their experience, should prepare 1-page experience form to convey their experience, meeting with municipality officials who would like to share their experience in the workshops, after the evaluation of the forms by the Project Team, confirming the municipalities to make presentations and topics of the presentations by meeting with the Local Administrations Advisory Group during 2 days.

## 6. Work Plan

After the approval of Ministries on the contemplated process, the estimated work plan starting by the December W3, is presented below. In this context, it is contemplated that organisation period of the experience sharing activities would be completed by June W1 by holding 1-day activities every week.

	Ara.20		Oca.21				Şub.21				Mar.21				Nis.21				May.21					
İşler	H3	H4	H1	H2	H3	H4	H1	H2	H3	H4	H1	H2	H3	H4	H1	H2	H3	H4	H1	H2	H3	H4	H1	
Sunucu adaylarına formların iletilmesi	■								■															
Formların doldurulması ve değerlendirilmesi		■	■							■	■													
Yerel Yönetimler Danışma Grubu Çalıştayları (2 adet x 1 gün)				■								■												
BŞB Etkinlik 1-10 organizasyon ve uygulama					■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■										
BŞİB Etkinlik 1-5 organizasyon ve uygulama																■	■	■	■	■				
Sonradan temaları belirlenecek etkinlikler (4 adet x 1 gün)																							■	■

As indicated above, in order to determine the experience to be shared in the activities, the following process will be followed: 1) Sending the experience forms to the survey respondents stating that they are interested in sharing experience, 2) evaluation of those forms and 3) conclusion of those forms in Local Administrations Advisory Group. It is planned that this process will be executed first for the metropolitan municipalities by December (2020) and then for the metropolitan district municipalities by February (2021).

Experience Sharing Activities are planned to be held as indicated below. Accordingly, estimated dates according to the activity topic and the work plan above, are listed below.

#### Experience Sharing Activities among Metropolitan Municipalities (MM)

- MM Activity 1: Growing scale and service organization – 1 (January W3)
- MM Activity 2: Growing scale and service organization – 2 (January W4)
- MM Activity 3: Cooperation and partnerships –1 (February W1)
- MM Activity 4: Cooperation and partnerships –2 (February W2)
- MM Activity 5: E-municipality, smart city and digital transformation – 1 (February W3)
- MM Activity 6: E-municipality, smart city and digital transformation – 2 (February W4)
- MM Activity 7: Strategic management – 1 (March W1)
- MM Activity 8: Strategic management – 2 (March W2)
- MM Activity 9: Human resources management – 1 (March W3)
- MM Activity 10: Human resources management – 2 (March W4)

#### Experience Sharing Activities among Metropolitan District Municipalities (MDM)

- MDM Activity 1: E-municipality, smart city and digital transformation (April W1)
- MDM Activity 2: Human resources management (April W2)
- MDM Activity 3: Strategic management (April W3)
- MDM Activity 4: Cooperation and partnerships (April W4)
- MDM Activity 5: Growing scale and service organization (May W1)

#### Experience sharing activities of which the themes will be later determined

- 1 activity every week between May W2 and June W1.

## ANNEX 1: Questionnaire

### Büyükşehir Modelinde Belediyeler Arası Deneyim Paylaşımı İhtiyaç Belirleme Anketi

UNDP Yerel Yönetim Reformu Projesi

İçişleri Bakanlığı ve Çevre ve Şehircilik Bakanlığı'nın yararlanıcısı olduğu Yerel Yönetim Reformu Projesi (YYR III) Birleşmiş Milletler Kalkınma Programı (UNDP) tarafından Avrupa Komisyonu mali desteğiyle yürütülmektedir.

Proje kapsamında mevcut büyükşehir modelinin uygulanmasında belediyeler arası karşılıklı bilgi ve deneyim paylaşımlarının yapılacağı etkinlikler gerçekleştirilecektir. Bu çerçevede deneyim ve ihtiyaçların belediye bazında tespit edilerek belediyeler arası yapılacak paylaşımların gündeminin ve katılımcılarının belirlenmesi amacıyla bu anket çalışması yapılmaktadır.

Ankette temel olarak belediyelerden 6360 sayılı Kanun sonrası öne çıkan bazı konularda diğer belediyeler ile paylaşmakta fayda gördükleri deneyimleri olup olmadığı ya da diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden faydalanmak isteyip istemedikleri sorulmaktadır. Bu bilgiler çerçevesinde belediye birimleri arasında taleplere göre eşleştirmeler yapılarak belirlenen birimlerin 2-3 kez katılacağı (koşullar elvermez ise web ortamında) toplantılar planlanacaktır.

Anketin büyükşehir belediyelerinde daire başkanlığı; büyükşehir ilçe belediyelerinde müdürlük düzeyindeki birim yöneticileri tarafından doldurulması beklenmektedir.

1. Belediyenizin türünü seçiniz, seçiminizin ardından anketin diğer soruları otomatik olarak görünecektir. \*

Büyükşehir Belediyesi

İlçe Belediyesi

1.1. Belediyenizin faaliyet gösterdiği İL yandaki listeden seçiniz. \*

Lütfen listeden seçiniz



1.2. Belediyenizin faaliyet gösterdiği İLÇEYİ aşağıdaki kutuya yazınız \*

Lütfen ilçenizi buraya yazınız

2. Biriminizin görev ve sorumluluklarına en yakın olan faaliyet alanını, gerek görürseniz birden fazla alan belirterek aşağıda işaretleyiniz. Eğer listede yer almıyorsa diğer seçeneğini kullanarak belirtiniz \*

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Atık yönetimi                                     | <input type="checkbox"/> Basın, yayın, tanıtım   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Bilgi teknolojileri ve akıllı şehirler            | <input type="checkbox"/> Çevre ve yeşil alan   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Fen işleri  | <input type="checkbox"/> Halkla ilişkiler, muhtarlarla ilişkiler, Kent Konseyi ile ilişkiler |
| <input type="checkbox"/> İç denetim  | <input type="checkbox"/> İnsan kaynakları yönetimi   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> İtfaiye, afet ve acil durum                       | <input type="checkbox"/> Kırsal hizmetler, kırsal kalkınma                                   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Kültür ve sanat, turizm                           | <input type="checkbox"/> Mali yönetim  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Mekânsal gelişim ve imar                          | <input type="checkbox"/> Sağlık, halk sağlığı, veterinerlik                                  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Sosyal hizmetler, yardımlar ve yaşam boyu öğrenme | <input type="checkbox"/> Spor hizmetleri   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Strateji geliştirme                               | <input type="checkbox"/> Su ve kanalizasyon  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Ulaşım  | <input type="checkbox"/> Zabıta, toplum düzeni ve güvenlik                                   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Diğer (Lütfen belirtiniz)                         |  |

3. Aşağıda ana başlıklar halinde belediyeler arası deneyim paylaşım toplantılarının planlanmasında kullanılmak üzere çeşitli konular listelenmektedir.

Genel ihtiyaç durumunu ortaya koymak ve biriminizin paylaşım toplantılarına seçilebilmesi için lütfen her bir ana başlık altında uygun gördüğünüz seçenekleri işaretleyiniz.

Bu kapsamda eğer konu hakkında örnek bir çalışma yürütüyor ve bunu **aktarmak** istiyorsanız 1. sütunu, eğer konu hakkında diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden  **faydalanmak** istiyorsanız 2. sütunu, konu ilgi alanınızın dışındaysa **hiçbiri** olarak belirtilen 3. sütunu seçiniz.

3.1. Büyükşehir-ilçe belediyesi koordinasyonu (hizmet paylaşımı, devirler, işbirliği). \*

	Birimimizin bu konuda diğer belediyelerin de yararlanmasında fayda olduğunu düşündüğümüz yenilikçi yaklaşımlar kullanarak yürüttüğü bazı çalışmalar var, bu çalışmaları <b>AKTARMAK İSTERİZ</b>	Birim olarak bu konuda diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden <b>FAYDALANMAK İSTERİZ</b>	<b>HIÇBİRİ</b>
1. Devredilebilir hizmetlerin (mezarlıklar, terminaller, mezbahalar vb.) planlanması, yürütülmesi ve izlenmesinde etkili koordinasyon için mekanizmalar, örnekler	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Paylaşılan hizmetlerde (zabıta, parklar, sosyal yardımlar vb.) etkili koordinasyon için mekanizmalar, örnekler	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Diğer alanlarda (imar, altyapı, ulaşım, kentsel dönüşüm vb.) etkili işbirliği ve koordinasyon için mekanizmalar, örnekler	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

3.2. Büyüyen ölçek ve hizmet örgütlenmesi. Kaynakların etkin olarak kullanılmasını sağlamak üzere yapılan çalışmalar. Kapasite geliştirme çalışmaları. \*

	Birimimizin bu konuda diğer belediyelerin de yararlanmasında fayda olduğunu düşündüğümüz yenilikçi yaklaşımlar kullanarak yürüttüğü bazı çalışmalar var, bu çalışmalarını <b>AKTARMAK İSTERİZ</b>	Birim olarak bu konuda diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden <b>FAYDALANMAK İSTERİZ</b>	<b>HIÇBİRİ</b>
1. Teşkilat yapısının yenilenmesi, hizmetlerin il ve ilçe düzeyinde örgütlenmesi, koordinasyonu	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. İl düzeyinde planlama ve hizmet sunumuna yönelik veritabanı, arayüz vb. oluşturulması	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Araç, makine ve malzemelerin daha verimli kullanılmasına ve takibine yönelik çalışmalar	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

3.3. Entegre kırsal alan yönetimi (Tarım ve hayvancılık, kırsal hizmetler, kırsal imar). \*

	Birimimizin bu konuda diğer belediyelerin de yararlanmasında fayda olduğunu düşündüğümüz yenilikçi yaklaşımlar kullanarak yürüttüğü bazı çalışmalar var, bu çalışmalarını <b>AKTARMAK İSTERİZ</b>	Birim olarak bu konuda diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden <b>FAYDALANMAK İSTERİZ</b>	<b>HIÇBİRİ</b>
1. Altyapı, sosyal ve ekonomik gelişime yönelik hizmetlerin bütüncül olarak planlanması ve yönetimi	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Kırsalda imar mevzuatının uygulanması, imar planlarının hazırlanması ve denetimi	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Kırsala, tarım ve hayvancılığa, kooperatiflere yönelik desteklerin planlanması ve uygulanması	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 3.4. Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler. \*

	Birimimizin bu konuda diğer belediyelerin de yararlanmasında fayda olduğunu düşündüğümüz yenilikçi yaklaşımlar kullanarak yürüttüğü bazı çalışmalar var, bu çalışmaları <b>AKTARMAK İSTERİZ</b>	Birim olarak bu konuda diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden <b>FAYDALANMAK İSTERİZ</b>	<b>HİÇBİRİ</b>
1. Kent konseyi belediye ilişkileri	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Kent konseyinin belediye hizmetlerinin planlanmasında ve izlenmesinde rolü	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Kent kararlarına mahalle meclisleri ve muhtarların katılımı	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4. Talep ve şikayet yönetimine yönelik beyaz masa, muhtarlarla ilişkiler vb.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
5. Yatırım yapılacak yerlerde yatırımdan etkilenecek gruplarla ilişkiler (halkın katılımı toplantısı, sosyal etki değerlendirme vb.)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 3.5. Stratejik yönetim. \*

	Birimimizin bu konuda diğer belediyelerin de yararlanmasında fayda olduğunu düşündüğümüz yenilikçi yaklaşımlar kullanarak yürüttüğü bazı çalışmalar var, bu çalışmaları <b>AKTARMAK İSTERİZ</b>	Birim olarak bu konuda diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden <b>FAYDALANMAK İSTERİZ</b>	<b>HİÇBİRİ</b>
1. Stratejik planlama, hedef, gösterge belirleme	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Bütçe yönetimi	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Kalite/Performans yönetim sistemleri	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4. İç kontrol süreçleri	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
5. İç denetim süreçleri	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
6. Projelendirme	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 3.6. Elektronik belediyecilik, akıllı kent ve dijital dönüşüm. \*

	Birimimizin bu konuda diğer belediyelerin de yararlanmasında fayda olduğunu düşündüğümüz yenilikçi yaklaşımlar kullanarak yürüttüğü bazı çalışmalar var, bu çalışmaları <b>AKTARMAK İSTERİZ</b>	Birim olarak bu konuda diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden <b>FAYDALANMAK İSTERİZ</b>	<b>HIÇBİRİ</b>
1. E-belediye, dijital belediye vb. sistemlerin kurulumu ve kullanımı	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Akıllı kent çalışmaları, bilişim sistemlerinin hizmetlerde kullanılması	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Yönetim bilgi sistemlerinin, teknolojilerinin hizmetlerin planlanması, sunumu ve izlenmesinde kullanımı	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4. Veri politikaları, veri yönetimi, veri güvenliği, veri paylaşımı vb. alanlarda yenilikçi çalışmalar	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 3.7. İnsan kaynakları yönetimi. \*

	Birimimizin bu konuda diğer belediyelerin de yararlanmasında fayda olduğunu düşündüğümüz yenilikçi yaklaşımlar kullanarak yürüttüğü bazı çalışmalar var, bu çalışmaları <b>AKTARMAK İSTERİZ</b>	Birim olarak bu konuda diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden <b>FAYDALANMAK İSTERİZ</b>	<b>HIÇBİRİ</b>
1. İnsan kaynakları politikalarının oluşturulması, insan gücü ve istihdam planlaması	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Personel mevzuatının uygulanması ve izlenmesinde, personel işlemlerinin yürütülmesinde yenilikçi yaklaşımlar, dijital çözümler	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Kurumsal öğrenme, hizmet içi eğitim, personelin yetiştirilmesi uygulamaları	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4. Personelin performansını izlemeye ve geliştirmeye yönelik yaklaşımlar, moral ve motivasyonu artırmaya dönük özel programlar ve ödüller	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 3.8. Sosyal hizmetler ve yardımlar. \*

	Birimimizin bu konuda diğer belediyelerin de yararlanmasında fayda olduğunu düşündüğümüz yenilikçi yaklaşımlar kullanarak yürüttüğü bazı çalışmalar var, bu çalışmaların <b>AKTARMAK İSTERİZ</b>	Birim olarak bu konuda diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden <b>FAYDALANMAK İSTERİZ</b>	<b>HİÇBİRİ</b>
1. Dezavantajlı kesimlerin belirlenmesine, sosyal hizmet ve yardım faydalanıcılarının tespitine ve takibine yönelik kurallar ve uygulamalar	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Sosyal hizmet ve yardımların sunumunun değerlendirilmesi ve iyileştirilmesine dönük çalışmalar	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Sosyal hizmet ve yardım süreçlerinde kamu, özel ve sivil toplum kuruluşlarıyla, muhtarlarla işbirliği ve koordinasyon	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 3.9. İşbirliği ve ortaklıklar. \*

	Birimimizin bu konuda diğer belediyelerin de yararlanmasında fayda olduğunu düşündüğümüz yenilikçi yaklaşımlar kullanarak yürüttüğü bazı çalışmalar var, bu çalışmaların <b>AKTARMAK İSTERİZ</b>	Birim olarak bu konuda diğer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden <b>FAYDALANMAK İSTERİZ</b>	<b>HİÇBİRİ</b>
1. Kamu-özel sektör işbirliği, yap-işlet-devret vb. modeller	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Finansör kuruluşlarla ilişkiler	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Belediyeler arası yurt içi ve yurt dışı işbirliği, kardeş şehir ilişkileri	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4. Sivil toplum kuruluşlarıyla, vakıflar ve derneklerle ilişkiler, işbirliği ve ortak projeler	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4. Deneyiminizi aktarmak ya da diđer belediyelerin deneyimlerinden faydalanmak üzere yukarıdaki listede yer almayan ya da yer almakla birlikte ayrıntılı bilgi vermek istediđiniz konuları (uygulama örnekleri dahil) ařađıda uygun kutularda açınız.

4.1. Deneyim aktarabileceđiniz ("biz bu konularda iyiyiz" diyebileceđiniz) konuları örnekleyerek belirtiniz.

4.2. Diđer belediyelerden faydalanmak istediđiniz konuları olabildiđince somutlařtırarak belirtiniz.

5. Eđer bu anket çerçevesinde elde edilecek bilgiler dođrultusunda karřılıklı eřleřtirmelerle planlanacak etkinliklerle ilgileniyorsanız etkinliklerin planlanması için iletiřim bilgilerinizi girmek üzere İLGİLENİYORUZ seçeneđini eđer ilgilenmiyorsanız İLGİLENMİYORUZ seçeneđini iřaretleyiniz \*

- Deneyim paylařımı toplantılarında paylařan ya da faydalanan olmak için İLGİLENİYORUZ
- Deneyim paylařımı toplantılarıyla İLGİLENMİYORUZ

5.1. Adı Soyadı, Görevi, Birimi \*

5.2. Telefon \*

5.3. E-posta \*

## ANNEX 2: Demand and Supply Tables of Metropolitan Municipalities and Metropolitan District Municipalities by Themes

### Metropolitan Municipalities

Ana Tema	Alt Tema	Talep (kişi)	Arz (Kişi)
7.0 İnsan kaynakları yönetimi	7.4 Personelin performansını izlemeye ve geliştirmeye yönelik yaklaşımlar	124	14
2.0 Büyüyen ölçek ve hizmet örgütlenmesi	2.2 İl düzeyinde planlama ve hizmet sunumuna yönelik veritabanı, arayüz vb. oluşturulması	122	26
9.0 İşbirliği ve ortaklıklar	9.2 Finansör kuruluşlarla ilişkiler	121	16
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.3 Kalite/Performans yönetim sistemleri	118	26
2.0 Büyüyen ölçek ve hizmet örgütlenmesi	2.1 Teşkilat yapısının yenilenmesi, hizmetlerin il ve ilçe düzeyinde örgütlenmesi, koordinasyonu	114	30
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.1 Stratejik planlama, hedef, gösterge belirleme	114	30
6.0 Elektronik belediyeçilik, akıllı kent ve dijital dönüşüm	6.3 Yönetim bilgi sistemlerinin ve teknolojilerinin kullanımı	113	29
9.0 İşbirliği ve ortaklıklar	9.4 Sivil toplum kuruluşlarıyla, vakıflar ve derneklerle ilişkiler, işbirliği ve ortak projeler	113	26
6.0 Elektronik belediyeçilik, akıllı kent ve dijital dönüşüm	6.4 Veri politikaları ve yönetiminde yenilikçi çalışmalar	112	26
9.0 İşbirliği ve ortaklıklar	9.1 Kamu-özel sektör işbirliği, yap-işlet-devret vb. modeller	112	15
9.0 İşbirliği ve ortaklıklar	9.3 Belediyeler arası yurt içi ve yurt dışı işbirliği, kardeş şehir ilişkileri	111	23
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.4 İç kontrol süreçleri	110	29
6.0 Elektronik belediyeçilik, akıllı kent ve dijital dönüşüm	6.1 E-belediye, dijital belediye vb. sistemlerin kurulumu ve kullanımı	110	36
6.0 Elektronik belediyeçilik, akıllı kent ve dijital dönüşüm	6.2 Akıllı kent çalışmaları, bilişim sistemlerinin hizmetlerde kullanılması	110	36
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.6 Projelendirme	109	31
2.0 Büyüyen ölçek ve hizmet örgütlenmesi	2.3 Araç, makine ve malzemelerin daha verimli kullanılmasına ve takibine yönelik çalışmalar	108	23
7.0 İnsan kaynakları yönetimi	7.3 Kurumsal öğrenme, hizmet içi eğitim, personelin yetiştirilmesi uygulamaları	106	24
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.2 Bütçe yönetimi	103	28
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.5 İç denetim süreçleri	103	24
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler	4.5 Yatırım yapılacak yerlerde yatırımdan etkilenecek gruplarla ilişkiler	100	17
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler	4.2 Kent konseyinin belediye hizmetlerinin planlanmasında ve izlenmesinde rolü	97	21
7.0 İnsan kaynakları yönetimi	7.2 Personel mevzuatı ve işlemlerinin yürütülmesinde yenilikçi yaklaşımlar	97	17
7.0 İnsan kaynakları yönetimi	7.1 İnsan kaynakları politikalarının oluşturulması, insan gücü ve istihdam planlaması	96	14
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler	4.1 Kent konseyi belediye ilişkileri	95	21
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler	4.3 Kent kararlarına mahalle meclisleri ve muhtarların katılımı	93	21
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler	4.4 Talep ve şikayet yönetimine yönelik beyaz masa, muhtarlarla ilişkiler vb.	83	27
1.0 Büyükşehir-ilçe belediyesi koordinasyonu	1.3 Diğer alanlarda etkili işbirliği ve koordinasyon için mekanizmalar, örnekler	78	25
3.0 Entegre kırsal alan yönetimi	3.1 Altyapı, sosyal ve ekonomik gelişime yönelik hizmetlerin bütüncül olarak planlanması ve yönetimi	78	17
1.0 Büyükşehir-ilçe belediyesi koordinasyonu	1.2 Paylaşılan hizmetlerde etkili koordinasyon için mekanizmalar	77	22
8.0 Sosyal hizmetler ve yardımlar	8.3 Sosyal hizmet ve yardım süreçlerinde paydaşlarla işbirliği ve koordinasyon	77	21
8.0 Sosyal hizmetler ve yardımlar	8.2 Sosyal hizmet ve yardımların sunumunun iyileştirilmesine dönük çalışmalar	73	22
1.0 Büyükşehir-ilçe belediyesi koordinasyonu	1.1 Devredilebilir hizmetlerin planlanması, yürütülmesi ve izlenmesinde etkili koordinasyon için mekanizmalar	71	25
8.0 Sosyal hizmetler ve yardımlar	8.1 Dezavantajlı kesimlerin belirlenmesine, takibine yönelik kurallar ve uygulamalar	69	26
3.0 Entegre kırsal alan yönetimi	3.3 Kırsala, tarım ve hayvancılığa, kooperatiflere yönelik desteklerin planlanması ve uygulanması	68	16
3.0 Entegre kırsal alan yönetimi	3.2 Kırsalda imar mevzuatının uygulanması, imar planlarının hazırlanması ve denetimi	67	14

Note: This table is listed according to absolute demand size. The themes above the dotted line, are prioritised for the activities.

## Metropolitan District Municipalities

Ana Tema	Alt Tema	Talep (kişi)	Arz (Kişi)
6.0 Elektronik belediyecilik, akıllı kent ve dijital dönüşüm	6.2 Akıllı kent çalışmaları, bilişim sistemlerinin hizmetlerde kullanılması	568	24
7.0 İnsan kaynakları yönetimi	7.4 Personelin performansını izlemeye ve geliştirmeye yönelik yaklaşımlar	566	17
6.0 Elektronik belediyecilik, akıllı kent ve dijital dönüşüm	6.4 Veri politikaları ve yönetiminde yenilikçi çalışmalar	551	16
6.0 Elektronik belediyecilik, akıllı kent ve dijital dönüşüm	6.1 E-belediye, dijital belediye vb. sistemlerin kurulumu ve kullanımı	551	48
6.0 Elektronik belediyecilik, akıllı kent ve dijital dönüşüm	6.3 Yönetim bilgi sistemlerinin ve teknolojilerinin kullanımı	544	22
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.6 Projelendirme	544	28
7.0 İnsan kaynakları yönetimi	7.3 Kurumsal öğrenme, hizmet içi eğitim, personelin yetiştirilmesi uygulamaları	544	15
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.1 Stratejik planlama, hedef, gösterge belirleme	542	49
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.3 Kalite/Performans yönetim sistemleri	535	39
9.0 İşbirliği ve ortaklıklar	9.4 Sivil toplum kuruluşlarıyla, vakıflar ve derneklerle ilişkiler, işbirliği ve ortak projeler	533	30
9.0 İşbirliği ve ortaklıklar	9.3 Belediyeler arası yurt içi ve yurt dışı işbirliği, kardeş şehir ilişkileri	530	25
2.0 Büyüyen ölçek ve hizmet örgütlenmesi	2.2 İl düzeyinde planlama ve hizmet sunumuna yönelik veritabanı, arayüz vb. oluşturulması	520	22
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.4 İç kontrol süreçleri	506	33
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.2 Bütçe yönetimi	503	47
2.0 Büyüyen ölçek ve hizmet örgütlenmesi	2.1 Teşkilat yapısının yenilenmesi, hizmetlerin il ve ilçe düzeyinde örgütlenmesi, koordinasyonu	502	26
5.0 Stratejik yönetim	5.5 İç denetim süreçleri	496	31
7.0 İnsan kaynakları yönetimi	7.2 Personel mevzuatı ve işlemlerinin yürütülmesinde yenilikçi yaklaşımlar	492	20
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler	4.5 Yatırım yapılacak yerlerde yatırımdan etkilenecek gruplarla ilişkiler	477	34
9.0 İşbirliği ve ortaklıklar	9.2 Finansör kuruluşlarla ilişkiler	473	12
9.0 İşbirliği ve ortaklıklar	9.1 Kamu-özel sektör işbirliği, yap-işlet-devret vb. modeller	473	20
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler	4.2 Kent konseyinin belediye hizmetlerinin planlanmasında ve izlenmesinde rolü	472	27
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler	4.4 Talep ve şikayet yönetimine yönelik beyaz masa, muhtarlarla ilişkiler vb.	470	55
2.0 Büyüyen ölçek ve hizmet örgütlenmesi	2.3 Araç, makine ve malzemelerin daha verimli kullanılmasına ve takibine yönelik çalışmalar	467	26
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler	4.1 Kent konseyi belediye ilişkileri	463	30
4.0 Katılım, paydaşlarla iletişim ve halkla ilişkiler	4.3 Kent kararlarına mahalle meclisleri ve muhtarların katılımı	452	35
7.0 İnsan kaynakları yönetimi	7.1 İnsan kaynakları politikalarının oluşturulması, insan gücü ve istihdam planlaması	435	14
1.0 Büyükşehir-ilçe belediyesi koordinasyonu	1.3 Diğer alanlarda etkili işbirliği ve koordinasyon için mekanizmalar, örnekler	406	26
1.0 Büyükşehir-ilçe belediyesi koordinasyonu	1.2 Paylaşılan hizmetlerde etkili koordinasyon için mekanizmalar	387	41
3.0 Entegre kırsal alan yönetimi	3.1 Altyapı, sosyal ve ekonomik gelişime yönelik hizmetlerin bütüncül olarak planlanması ve yönetimi	360	22
8.0 Sosyal hizmetler ve yardımlar	8.3 Sosyal hizmet ve yardım süreçlerinde paydaşlarla işbirliği ve koordinasyon	354	48
8.0 Sosyal hizmetler ve yardımlar	8.1 Dezavantajlı kesimlerin belirlenmesine, takibine yönelik kurallar ve uygulamalar	351	44
8.0 Sosyal hizmetler ve yardımlar	8.2 Sosyal hizmet ve yardımların sunumunun iyileştirilmesine dönük çalışmalar	338	44
3.0 Entegre kırsal alan yönetimi	3.3 Kırsala, tarım ve hayvancılığa, kooperatiflere yönelik desteklerin planlanması ve uygulanması	320	18
3.0 Entegre kırsal alan yönetimi	3.2 Kırsalda imar mevzuatının uygulanması, imar planlarının hazırlanması ve denetimi	315	13
1.0 Büyükşehir-ilçe belediyesi koordinasyonu	1.1 Devredilebilir hizmetlerin planlanması, yürütülmesi ve izlenmesinde etkili koordinasyon için mekanizmalar	286	15

Note: This table is listed according to absolute demand size. The themes above the dotted line, are prioritised for the activities.

## ANNEX 3: Demand and Supply Tables for Prioritised Experience Sharing Activities of Metropolitan Municipalities by Function and Municipality

Tables are prepared by theme, function and municipality.

2. Growing scale and service organization. Studies on effective utilisation of resources.

Capacity building actions

2.1. Renewal of organisational architecture, service organisation and coordination at provincial and district level

2.1 Demand	Information technologies and smart cities [ilk sütunda mükerrer]																				Total			
	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable property management, procurement, enterprises-subsidaries)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, correspondence, office, private)	Information technologies and smart cities [ilk sütunda mükerrer]				
Adana								1									1			2	4			
Ankara						1	1		1											2	5			
Antalya	1	1							1						1					1	5			
Aydın																				1	1			
Balıkesir														1							1			
Bursa									1											1	2			
Diyarbakır																	1			1	2			
Eskişehir														1			1				2			
Gaziantep			1																		1			
Mersin					1								1				2		3	4	1			
İstanbul				1	1			1							1					2	6			
İzmir					1	3				1		1									6			
Kocaeli	1													1	1		1			2	6			
Konya																1				1	2			
Malatya						1													1	1	3			
Manisa							1												1		2			
Kahramanmaraş			1			1				2							1			1	6			
Mardin		1				1					1									1	4			
Muğla					1				1												2	4		
Ordu													1								1	2		
Sakarya																					2	2		
Samsun															1		1			1	3			
Tekirdağ									1								1			1	3			
Trabzon				1	1	1					1	1								1	6			
Şanlıurfa		2		1	2										1					1	7			
Van	1				1					3							2			4	1			
Denizli		1	1							1						1		1		2	7			
Total	2	5	4	2	1	7	8	2	3	5	7	2	4	1	3	5	1	11	1	5	35	1	1	4

2.1 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable property management, procurement, enterprises-subsidaries)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, correspondence office, private secretariat)	Other	Total
	Adana													1
Ankara										1		1		2
Antalya	1												1	2
Balıkesir													1	1
Bursa		1				1						1		3
Denizli		1												1
Erzurum													1	1
Eskişehir							1							1
İzmir													1	1
Kocaeli		1	1					1			1	1		5
Konya													1	1
Malatya									1				2	3
Mersin	1				1				1				1	4
Şanlıurfa									1				1	2
Trabzon								1						1
Van				1										1
Total	2	3	1	1	1	1	1	2	3	1	1	3	10	30

2.2. Creating database, interface, etc. regarding planning and service delivery at provincial level

2.2. Demand	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens' Assembly	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Water and sewerage	Transportation	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable property)	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, correspondence office, private secretariat)	Other	Total
	Adana								1										1		1
Ankara								1	1	1			1				1		1	2	8
Antalya		1	1							1							2			1	6
Balıkesir															1						1
Bursa																				1	1
Diyarbakır											1							1		1	3
Erzurum																				1	1
Eskişehir															1					1	2
Mersin	1										1		1				1	2	3	5	14
İstanbul					1		1		1								2			2	7
İzmir						1	2				1		1							1	6

Kocaeli	1													1	1	1		1		1	6
Konya													1							1	2
Malatya																		1	1		2
Manisa								1										1			2
Kahramanmaraş			1				1				1							1		1	5
Mardin		1					1					1								2	5
Muğla	1									1										1	3
Ordu													1							1	2
Sakarya																				1	1
Samsun																1	1			2	4
Tekirdağ										1		1					2			2	6
Trabzon				1		1	1					1	1	1						2	8
Şanlıurfa		1		1		2														2	6
Van	2					1		1	1		3						2			4	14
Denizli		2									1									1	4
Total	5	5	2	2	1	5	6	4	3	4	8	3	5	3	3	1	7	11	6	38	122

2.2. Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Technical services	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, correspondence office, private secretarial)	Other	Total
	Adana											1
Antalya	1										1	2
Bursa			1			1			1			3
Gaziantep		1										1
Mersin	1							1			1	3
İstanbul											1	1
İzmir					1							1
Kocaeli				1			1		1	1		4
Konya											1	1
Malatya								1			2	3
Şanlıurfa					1		2	1			1	5
Denizli			1									1
Total	2	1	2	1	2	1	3	3	1	2	8	26

## 2.3. Studies on supervision and more effective utilisation of vehicles, machinery and materials

2.3 Demand	Waste management	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars and Citizens' Assembly	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Water and sewerage	Transportation	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee)	Other	Total
	Adana								1										1			3	5
Ankara								1	1	1											2	5	
Antalya			1	1						1											1	4	
Balıkesir																1					1	2	
Bursa							1			1											1	3	
Diyarbakır																		1			1	2	
Eskişehir																1						1	
Gaziantep			1	1																	1	3	
Mersin											1			1				2	1		2	4	11
İstanbul					1		1	1	1									1				4	
İzmir						1	3							1								5	
Kocaeli	1	1															1	1		1	1	6	
Konya														1							1	2	
Malatya							1														1	3	
Manisa								1														1	
Kahramanmaraş				1			1											1			1	4	
Mardin			1				1					1									1	4	
Muğla	1									1												3	
Ordu																						1	1
Sakarya																						1	1
Samsun																		1				1	2
Tekirdağ										1		1						1				1	4
Trabzon				1		1						1	1									2	6
Şanlıurfa			2			1												1				1	5
Van	1					1		1	1		3							1				4	12
Denizli			2	1								1								1		4	9
Total	1	3	7	4	1	1	4	8	4	3	5	5	3	3	1	2	1	5	7	1	4	35	108

2.3 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Sports services	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive)	Other	Total
	Ankara							1	1		
Antalya	1									1	2
Bursa					1						1
Erzurum										1	1
Mersin	1					1				1	3
İstanbul					1					1	2
Kocaeli		1	1	1				1			4
Konya										1	1
Malatya										2	2
Kahramanmaraş										1	1
Trabzon		1									1
Şanlıurfa						1				1	2
Denizli	1										1

Total	2	3	1	1	2	2	1	1	1	9	2	3
-------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

## 5. Strategic management

### 5.1. Strategic planning, setting goals and indicators

5.1 Demand	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and development planning	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Water and sewerage	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable services)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council executive)	Other	Total	
Adana																					2	2	
Ankara							1	1	1												1	3	7
Antalya		1	1													1						3	6
Aydın																						1	1
Balıkesir																						1	1
Bursa							1		1			1											3
Diyarbakır								1		1								1					3
Eskişehir												1		1									2
Mersin								1					1			1		1		3	3		10
İstanbul				1				1								2							4
İzmir				2	1	3																	6
Kocaeli	1				1									1	1	1		1				3	9
Konya												1										1	2
Malatya												1								1		3	5
Manisa							1																1
Kahramanmaraş										1												1	2
Mardin		1				1					1											3	6
Muğla	1				1				3														5
Samsun							1									1		1				3	6
Tekirdağ									1		1							2				1	5
Trabzon					1						1	1		1								1	5
Şanlıurfa		1		1	2											2	1					2	9
Van	1							1		3								1				4	10
Denizli																			1			3	4
Total	3	3	1	1	3	6	4	4	5	6	5	3	5	1	3	1	8	1	7	1	5	38	114

5.1 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Financial management	Spatial development, land development	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-)	Other	Total
Ankara		1									1					2
Antalya	1				1										1	3
Balıkesir									1							1
Bursa															1	1
Erzurum															1	1
Mersin	1										1			2	1	5
İstanbul										1					1	2
İzmir						1			1							2
Kocaeli				1		1		1					1	1		5
Konya															1	1
Malatya											1					1
Sakarya															2	2
Samsun							1									1
Trabzon								1								1

Şanlıurfa																		1	1
Denizli			1																1
Total	2	1	1	1	1	2	1	2	2	1	2	1	1	3	9	30			

### 5.3. Quality/Performance management systems

5.3 Demand	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Transportation	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee,	Other	Total	
	Adana								1													2
Ankara		1						1	1	1									1		3	8
Antalya		1	1													1					2	5
Aydın																					1	1
Balıkesir															1						1	2
Bursa								1		1			1									3
Diyarbakır									1								1					2
Eskişehir						1							1		1		1					4
Mersin									1					1		1	1		2		3	9
İstanbul					1				1							2					1	5
İzmir					2	1	3															6
Kocaeli	1					1									1	1	1				3	8
Konya													1								1	2
Malatya							1						1						1		3	6
Manisa								1														1
Kahramanmaraş											1										1	2
Mardin		1					1					1									3	6
Muğla	2					1				3												6
Sakarya																					1	1
Samsun																1	1				2	4
Tekirdağ										1		1					2				1	5
Trabzon				1		1						1	1	1	1						1	7
Şanlıurfa				1		1										2					2	6
Van	1							1	1		3						2				3	11
Denizli		1																	1		3	5
Total	4	4	1	2	3	6	5	5	5	6	4	3	5	2	4	8	9	1	4	37	118	

5.3 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Financial management	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Water and sewerage	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable property management, procurement, enterprises-subsidaries)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, correspondence office, private secretariat)	Other	Total
	Ankara											1			
Antalya	1				1									1	3
Bursa														1	1
Erzurum														1	1

Mersin	1									1			2	2	6
İstanbul									1						1
Kocaeli				1	1			1	1				1		5
Konya														1	1
Malatya										1					1
Samsun							1								1
Şanlıurfa		1									1			1	3
Van														1	1
Denizli				1											1
Total	2	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	1	3	1	1	2	8	26

#### 5.4. Internal control processes

5.4 Demand	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens' Assembly	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Transportation	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable property management, procurement, construction, subcontracting)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, correspondence office, private secretarial)	Other	Total	
	Adana								1									1			2	4
Ankara		1						1	1	1										1	3	8
Antalya		1	1													1					3	6
Aydın																					1	1
Balıkesir															1						1	2
Bursa										1			1									2
Diyarbakır									1								1					2
Eskişehir													1				1					2
Mersin									1					1		1	1			2	3	9
İstanbul					1				1							1					1	4
İzmir					2	1	3															6
Kocaeli	1					1									1	1	1			1	3	9
Konya													1								1	2
Malatya																				1	3	4
Kahramanmaraş											1										1	2
Mardin		1					1					1									3	6
Muğla	1									3												4
Ordu																					1	1
Sakarya																					1	1
Samsun																1	1				2	4
Tekirdağ												1					2					3
Trabzon				1		1						1	1	1	1						1	7
Şanlıurfa				1		1										1					2	5

Van	1							1	1		3					2			3	11	
Denizli		1															1		3	5	
Total	3	4	1	2	3	4	4	3	5	5	4	3	4	2	3	6	10	1	5	38	110

5.4 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Rural services, rural development	Financial management	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Water and sewerage	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable property management, <del>immovable property management</del> )	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, correspondence office, <del>secretarial affairs</del> )	Other	Total
	Ankara											1			
Antalya	1			1										1	3
Bursa														1	1
Erzurum														1	1
Eskişehir							1								1
Mersin	1									1			2	2	6
İstanbul									1						1
İzmir							1								1
Kocaeli			1			1		1				1			4
Konya														1	1
Malatya										1					1
Sakarya														1	1
Samsun					1										1
Tekirdağ				1										1	2
Şanlıurfa		1								1				1	3
Van														1	1
Total	2	1	1	2	1	1	2	1	1	3	1	1	2	10	29

## 5.6. Project design

5.6 Demand	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens' Assembly	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Transportation	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable property management, <del>immovable property management</del> )	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, correspondence office, <del>secretarial affairs</del> )	Other	Total
	Adana								1									1			2





Gaziantep			1														1
Mersin	2									1	1			2	1	7	
İstanbul										1						1	
Kayseri	1															1	
Kocaeli	1					1	1		1				1	1	1	7	
Konya															1	1	
Malatya															1	1	
Manisa													1			1	
Samsun								1								1	
Şanlıurfa		1		1			1									3	
Van	1														1	2	
Denizli		1			1											2	
Total	6	2	2	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	5	8	36

## 6.2. Smart city actions, utilisation of information technology systems in services

6.2 Demand	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens'	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Water and sewerage	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee,	Other	Total	
Adana								1											1			1	3
Ankara		1						1	1	1												3	7
Antalya		1								1							2					3	7
Aydın	1																					1	2
Balıkesir															1							1	2
Bursa										1													1
Diyarbakır									1		1									1		1	4
Eskişehir													1							1			2
Mersin									1		1			1			1			1	2	3	10
İstanbul					1				1								1					3	6
İzmir						1	3				1		1									1	7
Kocaeli									1						1	1	1			1		2	7
Konya													1									1	2
Malatya																						2	2
Kahramanmaraş			1								1						1			1		1	5
Mardin		1											1									2	4
Muğla	1																					1	2
Ordu																						1	1
Sakarya																						1	1
Samsun																				1		3	4
Tekirdağ								1		1		1								1		2	6
Trabzon				1		1							1	1								1	5
Şanlıurfa				1		1											1	1				2	6
Van	1							1	1		3									2		3	11
Denizli		1									1											1	3
Total	3	4	1	2	1	3	3	4	6	4	8	2	4	2	2	1	7	1	10	2	40	110	

6.2 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, council-executive office, notary)	Other	Total
	Ankara											1			1	
Antalya	1		1												1	3
Bursa											1					1
Erzurum															1	1
Gaziantep			1													1
Mersin	1										1	1		1	1	5
İstanbul											1					1
İzmir										1						1
Kayseri	1															1
Kocaeli	1				1	1	1		1		1		1			7
Konya															1	1
Manisa						1										1
Samsun							1				1					2
Trabzon															1	1
Şanlıurfa		1		1			1				1					4
Van	1														1	2
Denizli		1			1											2
Total	5	2	2	1	2	2	2	1	1	1	7	1	1	2	6	36

### 6.3. Utilisation of management information systems and technologies in planning, delivery and monitoring of services

6.3 Demand	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens'	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Water and sewerage	Transportation	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee,	Other	Total
	Adana								1										1		2
Ankara								1	1	1										3	6
Antalya		1	1							1							2			2	7
Aydın	1																			1	2
Balıkesir																				1	1
Bursa										1											1
Diyarbakır									1		1							1		1	4
Eskişehir													1		1				1		3
Mersin								1		1				1				1	2	2	8
İstanbul					1			1									1			2	5
İzmir					2	1	3				1		1								8
Kocaeli									1							1	1	1		3	8
Konya																				1	1
Malatya																				2	2
Manisa								1											1		2
Kahramanmaraş			1								1						1	1		1	5
Mardin		1					1					1								2	5
Muğla	1																			1	2
Ordu																				1	1
Sakarya																				1	1

Samsun																			1	1		3	5	
Tekirdağ										1			1								1		2	5
Trabzon					1		1	1						1	1								1	6
Şanlıurfa					1		1													1			3	6
Van	1							1	1			3										2	3	11
Denizli			1									1											2	4
Total	3	3	2	2	3	3	5	4	6	4	8	2	3	2	2	1	7	10	3	40	113			

6.3 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, <i>karar ve idare komisyonu</i> )	Other	Total
	Ankara														1	
Antalya	1														1	2
Balıkesir										1						1
Erzurum															1	1
Gaziantep			1													1
Mersin	1										1	1		1		4
İstanbul											1					1
Kayseri	1															1
Kocaeli	1					1	1		1		1		1	1		7
Konya															1	1
Samsun								1								1
Şanlıurfa		1		1			1				1					4
Van	1														1	2
Denizli		1			1											2
Total	5	2	1	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	4	1	1	3	4	29

#### 6.4. Innovative studies on data policies and data management, data security, data sharing etc.

6.4 Demand	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens'	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Water and sewerage	Transportation	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee,	Other	Total	
	Adana								1										1			2
Ankara								1	1												3	5
Antalya		1	1							1							2				1	6
Aydın	1																				1	2
Balıkesir															1							1
Bursa										1											1	2
Diyarbakır									1		1							1			1	4
Eskişehir						1							1		1							3
Gaziantep																	1					1
Mersin											1			1		1			2		2	7
İstanbul					1				1								1				3	6
İzmir					2	1	3				1										1	8
Kocaeli									1						1	1	1	1			3	8
Konya																					1	1
Malatya																					3	3
Manisa								1											1			2

Kahramanmaraş			1								1						1	1		1	5	
Mardin		1						1													2	4
Muğla	2																				1	3
Ordu																					1	1
Sakarya																					1	1
Samsun																	1	1			2	4
Tekirdağ										1		1									2	4
Trabzon				1		1							1	1							1	5
Şanlıurfa				1		1											1				2	5
Van	1							1	1		3							2			3	11
Denizli		1									1										4	6
Total	4	3	2	2	3	4	4	4	5	3	8	1	2	2	3	1	8	8	3	42	112	

6.4 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Human resources management	Rural services, rural development	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, council-executive office, private)	Other	Total
	Ankara											1		
Antalya	1												1	2
Erzurum													1	1
Gaziantep			1											1
Mersin	2								1	1		1		5
Kayseri	1													1
Kocaeli	1				1	1		1			1	1		6
Konya													1	1
Sakarya													1	1
Samsun							1							1
Şanlıurfa		1		1		1				1				4
Van	1												1	2
Total	6	1	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	2	1	3	5	26

## 7. Human resources management

### 7.3. Institutional learning, in-service training, staff training practices

7.3 Demand	Waste management	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens'	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Water and sewerage	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee,	Other	Total
	Adana								1												1			2
Ankara			1					1	1														2	5
Antalya			1							1								1						3
Aydın																							1	1
Balıkesir																1							1	2
Bursa										1														1
Diyarbakır									1		1										1			3
Eskişehir							1			1			1								1			4
Gaziantep																							1	1

Mersin										1	1	1			1			1	1	2	8			
İstanbul						1		1		1						1				2	6			
İzmir								3												1	4			
Kocaeli	1	1													1			1	1	1	6			
Konya													1								1			
Malatya								1												1	2			
Kahramanmaraş				1								2								1	4			
Mardin			1					1					1							1	4			
Muğla							1														1			
Ordu																				1	1			
Sakarya																				1	1			
Samsun																		1			1			
Tekirdağ											1		1	1					2		7			
Trabzon					1		1	1					1	1	1					2	8			
Şanlıurfa			1		1		2									1	1			4	10			
Van		1							1			3							2	3	10			
Denizli			2																1	5	8			
Total	1	2	6	1	2	1	5	7	3	4	5	7	3	4	2	1	1	3	1	10	1	2	34	106

7.3 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Sports services	Municipal police, social order and security	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, notary offices, private)	Other	Total
Ankara										1		1
Antalya	1										1	2
Bursa										1	1	2
Erzurum											1	1
Mersin	2		1					1		2		6
İzmir						1					1	2
Kocaeli				1	1		1		1			4
Konya											1	1
Kahramanmaraş											1	1
Şanlıurfa		1									1	2
Van											1	1
Denizli				1								1
Total	3	1	1	2	1	1	1	1	1	4	8	24

#### 7.4. Approaches to monitoring and improving staff performance and special programs and gifts to boost their mood and increase motivation

7.4 Demand	Waste management	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens' Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Water and sewerage	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, notary offices, private)	Other	Total	
Adana								1	1										1				2	5
Ankara			1					1	1														2	5
Antalya			1							1							1							3



Ankara									1	1										1	1	4		
Antalya		1									1					1						2	5	
Balıkesir															1								1	
Bursa								1			1												2	
Diyarbakır										1		1								1			4	
Erzurum																						1	1	
Eskişehir					1						1			1	1					1			5	
Mersin											1				1					1			4	
İstanbul							1				1						1						2	5
İzmir	1						1	3															1	6
Kayseri																							1	1
Kocaeli	1	1								1		1				1	1				1		3	10
Konya																							2	2
Malatya																						1	2	3
Kahramanmaraş					1							1								2			1	5
Mardin			1							1													1	3
Ordu																							1	1
Sakarya																							1	1
Samsun										1							1			1			2	5
Tekirdağ										1		1		1	1					2			2	8
Trabzon					1		1	1						1									1	5
Şanlıurfa			1		1		1												1				2	6
Van		1									1		3							2			3	10
Denizli			1										1								1		8	11
Total	2	3	3	2	2	1	3	6	4	5	5	7	2	2	1	3	4	1	10	2	2	42	11	2

9.1 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Technical services	Sports services	Municipal police, social order and security	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee, council-executive office, private)	Other	Total
Adana						2	2
Antalya						1	1
Bursa						1	1
Gaziantep		1					1
Mersin	1			1	2	1	5
Kocaeli			1				1
Malatya						1	1
Kahramanmaraş						1	1
Trabzon			1				1
Van						1	1
Total	1	1	2	1	2	8	15

## 9.2. Relations with financing institutions

9.2 Demand	Waste management	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens'	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee,	Other	Total
Adana									1										1			4	6



9.3 Demand	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens'	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, ads and lifelong learning	Sports services	Strategy development	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee,	Other	Total
	Adana								1	1												4
Ankara								1	1												3	5
Antalya		1														1					2	4
Aydin																					1	1
Balıkesir															1						1	2
Bursa										1												1
Diyarbakır									1		1							1			1	4
Eskişehir												1										1
Mersin																		1		1	5	7
İstanbul					1				1							1					1	4
İzmir						1	2				1										2	6
Kayseri																					1	1
Kocaeli	1								1		1			1	1	1					1	2
Konya																					1	1
Malatya																					1	3
Kahramanmaraş			1																			1
Mardin		1					1					1										2
Muğla	1									1												1
Ordu																						1
Sakarya																						1
Samsun																		1				1
Tekirdağ								1		1		1						1				2
Trabzon						1	1						1		1							1
Şanlıurfa		1		1		1											1					3
Van	1							1	1		3							2				4
Denizli		1									1								1			8
Total	3	4	1	1	1	3	4	4	6	3	7	2	2	1	3	3	1	6	1	3	52	11

9.3 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Technical services	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Financial management	Sports services	Municipal police, social order and security	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee,	Other	Total
	Adana									1	
Ankara								1	1		2
Antalya	1				1				1		3
Bursa									1		1
Erzurum									1		1
Eskişehir		1									1
Gaziantep		1									1
Mersin	1						1	2			4
Kocaeli			1	1				1			3
Konya									1		1
Malatya									1		1
Kahramanmaraş									1		1
Trabzon						1					1
Şanlıurfa									1		1

Van										1	1
Total	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	3	10	23

#### 9.4. Relations, cooperation and joint projects with non-governmental organisations, foundations and associations

9.4 Demand	Information technologies and smart cities	Environment and green areas	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens'	Internal Audit	Human resources management	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Culture and arts, tourism	Financial management	Spatial development, land development planning and control	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Strategy development	Transportation	Municipal police, social order and security	Asset management (support services, vehicle, immovable)	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee,	Other	Total
	Adana								1									1			3
Ankara								1	1				1						1	3	7
Antalya		1													1					1	3
Aydın																				1	1
Balıkesir														1							1
Bursa										1			1								2
Diyarbakır									1		1						1			1	4
Erzurum																				1	1
Eskişehir			1										1								2
Mersin									1			1					1		1	5	9
İstanbul					1				1						2					1	5
İzmir						1	2				1	1								2	7
Kayseri																				1	1
Kocaeli	1								1					1	1					4	8
Konya																				1	1
Malatya													1						1	2	4
Manisa								1													1
Kahramanmaraş			1																		1
Mardin		1					1													2	4
Muğla										2										1	3
Ordu																				1	1
Sakarya																				2	2
Samsun															1		1			2	4
Tekirdağ								1		1		1	1				1			2	7
Trabzon						1	1					1	1							1	5
Şanlıurfa		1		1		1									1	1				2	7
Van	1								1		3						1			3	9
Denizli		1									1							1		5	8
Total	2	4	2	1	1	3	4	4	6	4	6	4	6	2	6	1	6	1	3	47	113

9.4 Supply	Information technologies and smart cities	Technical services	Public relations, relations with mukhtars, and Citizens'	Fire department, disaster and emergency	Rural services, rural development	Financial management	Health, public health and veterinary	Social services, aids and lifelong learning	Sports services	Municipal police, social order and security	Legal Affairs	Secretarial affairs (clerical tasks, council-executive committee,	Other	Total
	Adana													2
Antalya	1					1							1	3

Bursa							1						1	2
Gaziantep		1												1
Mersin	2								1		1			4
İzmir													1	1
Kocaeli				1	1				1		1	1		5
Konya													1	1
Malatya													2	2
Kahramanmaraş													1	1
Samsun								1						1
Trabzon			1						1					2
Van													1	1
Total	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	1	1	2	10	26

## ANNEX 4: Criteria on good practice sharing

- The grant scheme titled “Erasmus+ Programme” being implemented between 2014 and 2020 by the European Union, involves education, youth and sports areas. In the context of the programme in question whose main goal is to give some skills to individuals, improve their personal development, enhance employment opportunities without paying attention to their age, educational background, an online platform is established for teachers, school administrators, researchers, teacher trainers, policymakers, all other professionals working in school management: “School Education Gateway”. On the platform in question, criteria on selection of good practices is stated as:<sup>1</sup>

1	Relevant timescale	Measure/approach that has been in place for at least two years.
2	Some evidence of sustainability	Measure/approach that has been in place for some time and has secured funding or other support (involvement of a range of stakeholders) for a few years into the future.
3	Involvement of relevant stakeholders	A broad range of stakeholders should be involved (parents, employers, civil society, expert professionals, etc.). Details on how the different stakeholders are involved and supported (e.g. trained) should be provided.
4	Research-based or evidence-based	The extent to which the measure and/or approach is informed or rooted in previous research or experience.
5	Quality assurance procedures in place	Measure/approach with quality assurance processes in place, including information on indicators, methods or tools used throughout the implementation
6	Internal and external evaluation results	Measure/approach that has been evaluated (preferably through external evaluation) and has documented evidence that it has achieved intended outcomes and results.

- According to the document<sup>2</sup> which was published by the Protection Cluster Working Group (PCWG), which is presided by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) and consisted of many participants of *Inter-Agency Standing Committee* such as UN, NGOs and Red Cross, the criteria on good practice sharing -it may change according to type of the practice- are as follows:

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://www.schooleducationgateway.eu/en/pub/resources/toolkitsforschools/general/criteria.htm>

<sup>2</sup> <https://www.unhcr.org/4aa76e97378.pdf>

1	Key Criteria	Impact	Did the practice have a positive and tangible impact and result in improved protection for individuals and/or communities? Did it have any negative impact? Did impact differ in the immediate, medium or longer-term? Did impact differ depending on factors such as age, gender and/or socio-economic background of persons of concern?
2		Relevance	Did the practice address the needs and priorities of persons of concern? Did it do so in an appropriate manner?
3		Coherence	Was the practice consistent with overall policy and professional codes of conduct, including relevant legal standards and IASC guidelines? Did it complement rather than duplicate or undermine similar practices or projects?
4	Additional Criteria	Effectiveness	Did the practice achieve what it aimed to achieve (in a timely manner)?
5		Efficiency	Was efficient use made of available financial, human and other resources? Could the same result have been achieved through more efficient use of resources?
6		Sustainability	Was the practice sustainable and/or did it have a sustainable impact? Was an effort made to seek solutions to root causes?
7	Protection Criteria	Respecting and Protecting Rights	Did the practice aim to improve the protection of individuals and/or communities? Was it based on and aimed at ensuring respect for the rights of persons of concern as outlined in relevant bodies of law (human rights law, humanitarian law or refugee law)?
8		Participation	Were persons of concern consulted and did they participate in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the practice? Did the practice strengthen local capacity and encourage local ownership?
9		Non- discrimination and Equality	Did the women, men and children with different ages, abilities and background have the equal effective access to the practice? Alternatively, did the practice aim to combat discrimination and further equality by building the capacity of certain individuals and groups, such as such as women, children, older persons, persons with disabilities, and/or minorities?

- As a result of a process, initiated in Habitat II Conference held in 1996 in Istanbul, International Union of Local Authorities (IULA), World Federation of United Cities (FMCU-UTO) and World Association of Major Metropolises (Metropolis) were reunited under the name of “United Cities and Local Governments World Organisation” (UCLG) in 2004. UCLG Organisation which involves local administrations, local and regional associations and cities from various regions of the world, is the most extensive local and regional management network, representing 240,000 cities in total. Creating

cultural networks, developing programs and policies and performing the activities, which promotes the culture as forth column of sustainable development are among the aims of the Cultural Committee which is one of the 12 different committees of UCLG. The criteria, being utilised in the process of determination of good practices by the Cultural Committee of are as follows:<sup>3</sup>

1	Innovation	The innovative nature of a project facilitates adopting a different approach from conventional approaches in which the ins and outs are known. It takes us from a narrow reflection on a particular problem to a broader reflection which considers more aspects and dimensions. Innovation refers to both contents and topics for development projects as well as processes and methodologies.
2	Participation	Involvement and participation of citizens in cultural projects is paramount. It is essential for the final recipient of a cultural development project to be an actor from the beginning to the end of the project. Only the mobilization of bottom-up expertise (user / inhabitant / citizen) enables true appropriation of cultural projects.
3	Sustainability	Local development cannot be conceived of without a sustainable and lasting dimension. Development projects and policies must be designed over time, in the short, medium and long term. This both allows the actions and decisions to be included in global dynamics and to be able to constantly readapt methodological practices and strategic thinking in regard to policies.
4	Efficiency	The criterion of efficiency is in regard to the production of one or more positive, tangible and intangible impact(s) on the territories and on the populations. The effects of a cultural development project or policy must be measurable in terms of objectives determined by initially established diagnostics.
5	Transversality	The adoption of a transversal approach to a problem may combine different issues with different methodologies and different actors of society. Transversality thus favours the co-construction and co-

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://obs.agenda21culture.net/en/about>

		implementation of cultural projects and includes them in the dynamics of exchange and shared responsibility.
6	Reproducibility	Local development projects, actions and policies must be at least partially reproducible or transferable. Fully explaining contexts is essential to understand a good practice and for this reproducibility to be possible.

- As stated in the report being titled “Good Practices Report: Participatory Citizenship in European Union”<sup>4</sup> in the context of “Europe for Citizens” (EFC) Programme which is conducted under the European Commission, the criteria which are utilised for identifying good practices, are as follows:

1	Clarity	Have a clear definition of objectives, activities to be carried out, participants, stakeholders and target groups.
2	Consistency	Display consistency between set goals and the activities implemented.
3	Participation	Demonstrate the active and direct participation of involved participants (e.g., democratic decision making processes).
4	Cooperation	Demonstrate collaboration between different institutions, associations and organisations.
5	Innovation	Demonstrate the ability to make use of or include new technologies and new media.
6	Evaluation	Demonstrate outcomes and impact evaluation.
7	Knowledge Sharing	Make available the information on outcomes and evaluations at local, regional and national levels.
8	Values	Conform to the values of democracy, human rights, social cohesion and tolerance.

---

<sup>4</sup> [https://ec.europa.eu/citizenship/pdf/report\\_3\\_good\\_practice.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/citizenship/pdf/report_3_good_practice.pdf)

- “Directorate General for Health and Food Safety” (DG SANTE), which is one of 33 General Directorates operating under the European Commission, is responsible for EU policy on food safety and health and for monitoring the implementation of related laws. The proposal for set of criteria which are utilised for identifying good practices process by DG SANTE, are as follows:<sup>5</sup>

1	Inclusion Criteria	Convenience	Political/strategic context of the practice or intervention, which needs to be clearly explained and considered.
2		Intervention characteristics	the existence of a situation analysis, established objectives, a consistent methodology etc.
3		Evidence and theory based	Scientific excellence or other evidence was used, analysed and disseminated in a conscious, explicit and thoughtful manner.
4		Ethics	Respectful with ethic values and guarantees the safeguarding of dignity
5	Core Criteria	Effectiveness and Efficiency	The degree to which the intervention was successful in producing a desired result in an optimal way. It measures the extent to which the objectives of quantity, quality and time have been met under real conditions at the lowest possible cost.
6		Equity	The practice should take into account the needs of the population (men and women) when allocating the resources and identify and reduce health inequalities.
7	Qualifier Criteria	Transferability	To which extent the implementation results are systematized and documented, making it possible to transfer it to other contexts/settings/countries or to scale it up to a broader target population/geographic context.
8		Sustainability	Assesses the practice's ability to be maintained in the long-term with the available resources, adapting to social, economic and environmental requirements of the context in which it is developed.
9		Intersectoral Coordination	Assesses the ability of the practice to foster collaboration among the different sectors involved in the domain of interest.
10		Participation	Assesses the inclusion of stakeholders throughout the whole life cycle of the process and the ability of the practice to foster collaboration among the different sectors involved.

<sup>5</sup> [https://ec.europa.eu/health/sites/health/files/major\\_chronic\\_diseases/docs/ev\\_20161130\\_co01\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/health/sites/health/files/major_chronic_diseases/docs/ev_20161130_co01_en.pdf)

- As stated in the issue titled “A Users' Guide to Measuring Local Governance”<sup>6</sup> which is prepared by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), control list on good practices are as follows:

1	Objective and Purpose	Define the specific purpose, focus and expected scope of the entire assessment process.
2	Stakeholders	Map key stakeholders and identify their needs, preferences and interests in local governance assessment.
3	A Holistic Concept	Ensure focus, while facilitating incorporation of a holistic concept of governance (i.e. not only formal structures and services, but also on processes and relationships).
4	Objective	Derive the assessment objectives from the local development needs and the strategic policy agenda.
5	Representation and Participation	Ensure that there is a focus on the needs of the poor, women, children and other disadvantaged groups. Use all opportunities (and create new ones) for integrating pro-poor and gender sensitive measures – without which the assessment will not serve as a basis for equitable local development.

- “Quality Criteria for Database of Good practices”<sup>7</sup> are determined by the European Literacy Policy Network (ELINET) as follows:

1	Target Audience	Focusing on the target audience of the project/practise clearly.
2	Conceptual basis	A clear and sound conceptual basis (programme theory) which is well grounded in scientific research.
3	Objective	A clear definition of objectives
4	Documentation	Documentation concerning the implementation of the program (clear information about the activities to be carried out, about participants, stakeholders and target groups etc.)
5	Transparency	Transparent documentation of the evaluation of the project and its effects on the target Group

---

<sup>6</sup> [https://www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/librarypage/democratic-governance/local\\_governance/a-users-guide-to-measuring-local-governance-.html](https://www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/librarypage/democratic-governance/local_governance/a-users-guide-to-measuring-local-governance-.html)

<sup>7</sup> <http://www.eli-net.eu/good-practice/examples-of-good-practice/criteria-for-examples-of-good-practice/>

6	Transferability	The practice or project have the potential of being applied to parallel or similar situations in the same or different regions.
7	The program outcomes	The program outcomes (flyers, manuals, materials) should be available in print or –preferably - in the internet.
8	Sustainability	The programme should be financially sustainable.

- “The Community Tool Box” is a free, online resource to build healthier communities and bring about social change. Under the title “Promoting the Adoption and Use of Best Practices”<sup>8</sup>, the following criteria are established:

1	Scope	They are comprehensive, aiming at all aspects of an issue.
2	Flexible and Responsive	They are flexible and responsive, reacting to the needs of the population and changes in circumstances and conditions.
3	Stability	They persevere, keeping at it as long as is necessary – indefinitely, if that’s what it takes.
4	Context	They look at issues and people in their context – family, history, community, etc.
5	Underlying Causes of the Problem	They target the underlying causes in addition to the symptoms of an issue or problem.
6	Accuracy	They have – and stick to – a clear mission.
7	Improvement through the process	They evolve over time, as need dictates.
8	Competent Personnel	They are managed by competent people with appropriate skills.
9	Staff Training	Their staff members are trained and supported to provide high-quality, responsive service.
10	Participation	They foster strong staff/participant relationships based on mutual respect.
11	Cooperation	They collaborate, both internally and externally.

---

<sup>8</sup> <https://ctb.ku.edu/en/table-of-contents/analyze/choose-and-adapt-community-interventions/using-best-practices/main>

12	Motivation	Both the organization and individual staff members have a set of core values that strengthen their dedication, morale, and resolve, and that give them a shared sense of purpose for the work.
----	------------	--

- The criteria on good practices which are determined in the context of “Technical assistance for institutional enhancement of local government in Greece”<sup>9</sup> which is executed by Council of Europe and European Union, are as follows:

1	Relevance	The initiative has solved an important problem for the community;
2	Efficiency	The activity had good results/costs ratio;
3	Innovation	A new creative approach to the problem addressed has been found and applied;
4	Impact	Practical and clearly identifiable results have been recorded;
5	Sustainability	The initiative prescribes into a broad and long-term perspective on the future of the local community along with a sense of what is needed for local development;
6	Reproducibility	Has the possibility to be implemented also in other communities;
7	Integration	The initiative has created synergies that can result to multiplier effects;
8	Capitalization	The dissemination of the initiative aims to enhance, exchange and diffuse its achievements.

---

<sup>9</sup> <https://rm.coe.int/16806fa090>